Committee Name: VMC Proposal Subcommittee  
Chairperson: Bill Dewey  
Date of Meeting: August 24, 2011  
Roster: (Members with ☒ attend meetings)

- ☒ Lori Howell  
- ☒ Chris Nelson  
- ☒ Bill Dewey  
- ☒ Kathy Brohawn  
- ☒ Andy Depaola  
- ☒ Bill Kramer  
- ☒ Ken Moore  
  - ☒ Mike Hickey  
  - ☒ Kirk Wiles  
  - ☒ Maryanne Guichard  
  - ☒ Leslie Palmer  
  - ☒ Paul DiStefano  
  - ☒ Spencer Garrett

Charge 1: The Subcommittee will develop potential *Vibrio vulnificus* control options for VMC consideration.

Findings:
The subcommittee held 4 conference calls and exchanged numerous emails. Proposal 11-201 was included in the 2011 proposal package to meet the notification requirements of ISSC Constitution, By Laws and Procedures. The subcommittee reviewed several 2011 proposals in their deliberations. They included:

- Proposal 11-202- *Vibrio vulnificus* and *Vibrio parahaemoylyticus* Risk Management of Oysters
- Proposal 11-203- *Vibrio vulnificus* Management
- Proposal 11-205- *Vibrio* Management Committee Membership

The subcommittee also discussed 09-207 which has an implementation date of January 1, 2012. Other items of discussion include the following:

- Section 114 of the Food Safety Modernization Act
- Congressional Correspondence-Dated May 25, 2011
- Previous deliberation by the VMC
- Vv Illness calculations
- Vv Growth Curves
- Vv Risk per serving estimates based on the FDA risk calculator and FDA risk assessment

Conclusions:

Recommendations: The subcommittee developed the attached proposals for consideration by the VMC.

Additional Information:

Recorder: Heather Thomas  
Approved by: Bill Dewey
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Submitter:</th>
<th>Vibrio Management Committee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Affiliation:</td>
<td>Interstate Shellfish Sanitation Conference (ISSC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Address:</td>
<td>209-2 Dawson Road Columbia, SC 29223-1740</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phone:</td>
<td>803-788-7559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fax:</td>
<td>803-788-7576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email:</td>
<td><a href="mailto:issc@issc.org">issc@issc.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposal Subject:</td>
<td>Vibrio vulnificus Risk Management of Oysters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific NSSP Guide Reference:</td>
<td>ISSC Constitution, Bylaws, and Procedures Article IV. Section II Model Ordinance, Chapter II Risk Assessment and Risk Management .01 Outbreaks of Shellfish Related Illnesses .04 Vibrio vulnificus Risk Management for Oysters Section IV. Guidance Documents, Chapter IV. Naturally Occurring Pathogens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Words:</td>
<td>Vibrio vulnificus Risk Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Text of Proposal/Requested Action:</td>
<td>Article IV. Executive Board, Officers, Committees Section 10. The Board may appoint committees from industry, educational institutions, research fields, or any other areas as needed to report to the Board and advise the Conference on proposals under consideration. Committee appointments will be made from the Conference membership by the Executive Board Chairman. The following committees shall be designated as standing committees and shall convene as needed or as directed by the Executive Board or Chairperson of the Conference: Education, Foreign Relations, Proposal Review, Patrol, Research Guidance, Resolutions, and Shellfish Restoration, and Vibrio Management Committee. The Vice-Chairperson of the Conference shall assist the Executive Director in encouraging development of committee work plans and completion of subcommittee assignments prior to convention of the Biennial Meeting. Section 14. The Executive Board Chairperson shall appoint a sixteen (16) member Vibrio Management Committee. The Committee will be comprised of a Chairperson and regional representation from all ISSC regions with at least two (2) industry members from the East, Gulf and West coasts. The Committee will also include representation from the FDA, NOAA, and EPA. Non voting advisors will be appointed as appropriate. The Committee will assess if additional changes are needed in the NSSP Guide for the Control of Molluscan Shellfish Model Ordinance to reduce the risk of Vibrio illnesses. The Committee will annually review trends in Vibrio illnesses.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter II Risk Assessment and Risk Management
@.01 Outbreaks of Shellfish Related Illnesses

J. The Authority shall assess annually *Vibrio vulnificus* and *Vibrio parahaemolyticus* illnesses associated with the consumption of molluscan shellfish. The assessment will include a record of all *Vibrio vulnificus* and *Vibrio parahaemolyticus* shellfish-associated illnesses reported within the State and from receiving States, the numbers of illnesses per event, and actions taken by the Authority in response to the illnesses.

.04 *Vibrio vulnificus* Risk Management for Oysters.

A. For states having 2 or more etiologically confirmed shellfish-borne *Vibrio vulnificus* illnesses since 1995 traced to the consumption of commercially harvested raw or undercooked oysters that originated from the waters of that state (Source State), the Authority shall develop and implement a *Vibrio vulnificus* Management Plan.

B. The Source State's *Vibrio vulnificus* Management Plan shall define the administrative procedures and resources necessary to accomplish (i.e. establish and maintain) involvement by the state in a collective illness reduction program. The goal of the *Vibrio vulnificus* Management Plan will be to reduce the rate of etiologically confirmed shellfish-borne *Vibrio vulnificus* septicemia illnesses reported collectively by California, Florida, Louisiana, and Texas, from the consumption of commercially harvested raw or undercooked oysters by 40 percent for years 2005 and 2006 (average) and by 60 percent for years 2007 and 2008 (average) from the average illness rate for the years 1995–1999 of 0.303/million. The list of states (California, Florida, Louisiana, Texas) used to calculate rate reduction may be adjusted if after a thorough review, epidemiological and statistical data demonstrates that it would be appropriate. The illness rate shall be calculated as the number of illnesses per unit of population. The goal may be reevaluated prior to the year 2006 and adjusted in the event that new science, data, or information becomes available. State’s compliance with the Plan will require States to maintain a minimum of 60% reduction in years subsequent to 2008. Determination and compliance after 2008 will be based on two-year averages beginning in 2009.

C. The Source State's *Vibrio vulnificus* Management Plan shall include, at a minimum:

1. The ISSC Consumer Education Program targeted toward individuals who consume raw oysters and whose health condition(s) increase their risk for *Vibrio vulnificus* illnesses;
2. A process to collected standardized information for each *Vibrio vulnificus* illness: including underlying medical conditions; knowledge of disease status; prior counseling on avoidance of high risk foods, including raw oysters; existence of consumer advisories at point of purchase or consumption; and, if possible, whether consumer was aware and understood the advisories;
3. A standardized process for tracking products implicated in *Vibrio vulnificus* illnesses;
4. Identification and preparation for achieving a goal of post harvest processing capacity of 25 percent of all oysters intended for the raw, half-shell market during the months of May through September harvested from a Source State by the end of the third year (December 31, 2004). The percentage of post harvest processing will include the capacity of all operational plants and the capacity of plants under construction;
5. Identification and preparation for implementation of required post
harvest processing capacity of 50% of all oysters intended for the raw, half-shell market during the months of May through September, harvested from a Source State, which shall be implemented should the 40 percent illness reduction goal not be achieved by December 31, 2006. The percentage of post-harvest processing will include the capacity of all operational plants and the capacity of plants under construction. In the alternative, the state may utilize the control measures, or equivalent control measures, listed in @.04, (C), (6) (a), (b), (c), and (d) below for such periods of time which, in combination with post-harvest processing, will provide equivalent outcomes. This portion of the plan shall be completed no later than December 31, 2005; and

(6) Identification and preparation for implementation of one or more of the following controls, or equivalent controls, which shall be implemented should the 60 percent rate of illness reduction goal not be achieved collectively by 2008. The control measures identified in the plan shall be appropriate to the state and reflect that state’s contribution to the number of Vv illnesses and the controls that have been implemented by each state. This portion of the Plan shall be completed no later than December 2007. The temperature and month-of-the-year parameters identified in the following controls may be adjusted by the ISSC Executive Board as recommended by the Vibrio Management Committee (VMC) on a state by state basis, as needed to achieve the established illness reduction goal. The adjustment to the State’s plan can take into account the illness rate reduction that has occurred since the last review of the plan.

(a) Labeling all oysters, "For shucking by a certified dealer", when the Average Monthly Maximum Water Temperature exceeds 75°F;
(b) Subjecting all oysters intended for the raw, half-shell market to an Authority-approved post-harvest processing that reduces the Vibrio vulnificus levels to <30 MPN/gram when the Average Monthly Maximum Water Temperature exceeds 75°F;
(c) Closing shellfish growing areas for the purpose of harvest of oysters intended for the raw, half-shell market when the Average Monthly Maximum Water Temperature exceeds 75°F;
(d) Labeling all oysters, "For shucking by a certified dealer", during the months of May through September, inclusive;
(e) Subjecting all oysters intended for the raw, half-shell market to a post-harvest processing that is both approved by the Authority and reduces the Vibrio vulnificus levels to <30 MPN/gram during the months of May through September, inclusive; and
(f) Closing shellfish growing areas for the purpose of harvesting oysters intended for the raw, half-shell market during the months of May through September, inclusive.

Effective January 1, 2012:

@.04 Vibrio vulnificus Risk Management for Oysters

A. For states having 2 or more etiologically confirmed shellfish-borne Vibrio vulnificus illnesses since 1995 traced to the consumption of commercially harvested raw or undercooked oysters that originated from the waters of that state (Source State), the Authority shall develop and implement a Vibrio vulnificus Risk Management Plan.

B. The Source State’s Vibrio vulnificus Risk Management Plan shall define the
administrative procedures and resources necessary to accomplish (i.e. establish and maintain) involvement by the state in a collective illness risk reduction program. The goal of the *Vibrio vulnificus* Risk Management Plan will be to reduce the risk per serving to a 60% illness rate reduction for etiologically confirmed shellfish-borne *Vibrio vulnificus* septicemia illnesses reported collectively by California, Florida, Louisiana, and Texas, from the consumption of commercially harvested raw or undercooked oysters to a level equivalent to a 60% illness rate reduction from 1995—1999 baseline average illness rate of 0.278 per million.

C. The Source State's *Vibrio vulnificus* Risk Management Plan shall include, at a minimum:

1. The ISSC Consumer Education Program targeted toward individuals who consume raw oysters and whose health condition(s) increase their risk for *Vibrio vulnificus* illnesses;
2. A process to collect standardized information for each *Vibrio vulnificus* illness: including underlying medical conditions; knowledge of disease status; prior counseling on avoidance of high risk foods, including raw oysters; existence of consumer advisories at point of purchase or consumption; and, if possible, whether consumer was aware and understood the advisories;
3. A standardized process for tracking products implicated in *Vibrio vulnificus* illnesses; and
4. Identification and implementation of the controls, or equivalent controls, which produced an illness per serving equivalent to a 60% illness rate reduction in the core states.

### @.04 *Vibrio vulnificus* Control Plan

#### A. Risk Evaluation

Each oyster producing State shall conduct a *Vibrio vulnificus* risk evaluation annually. The evaluation shall consider each of the following factors, including seasonal variations in the factors, in determining the risk of *Vibrio vulnificus* infection from the consumption of oysters harvested from the State’s growing waters.

1. In conducting the risk evaluation the State Authority will at a minimum consider the following:
   
   a. The number of *Vibrio vulnificus* cases epidemiologically linked to the consumption of oysters commercially harvested from the State; and
   b. Levels of *Vibrio vulnificus* in the growing waters and in shellfish, to the extent that such data exists; and
   c. The quantity of harvest from the area and its uses i.e. shucking, half shell, PHP.

#### B. The State shall develop and implement a *Vibrio vulnificus* Control Plan should the risk evaluation indicate:

1. Two (2) or more etiologically confirmed shellfish-borne *Vibrio vulnificus* illnesses within the past calendar year traced to the consumption of commercially harvested raw or undercooked oysters that originated from the growing waters of that state; or
2. Five (5) or more etiologically confirmed shellfish-borne *Vibrio vulnificus* illnesses within the past calendar year traced to the consumption of commercially harvested raw or undercooked oysters that originated from the growing waters of that state; or
V. vibnificus illnesses in any five (5) year period since 1995 traced to the consumption of commercially harvested raw or undercooked oysters that originated from the growing waters of that state.

C. The State shall develop a *Vibrio vulnificus* Contingency Plan should the risk evaluation indicate:

(1) Any etiologically confirmed shellfish-borne *Vibrio vulnificus* illness since 1995 from the growing waters of that State but the number of cases does not reach the threshold established in B. (1) and (2); or

(2) Levels of *Vibrio vulnificus* in the growing waters and in shellfish that is reasonably likely to cause an illness; and

(3) The amount of oysters commercially harvested from the State is of an amount that would result in a risk per serving that is reasonably likely to result in an illness.

D. Control Plan

(1) The *Vibrio vulnificus* Control Plan shall include the following:

(a) Identification of triggers which address factors that affect risks. The triggers will be used to indicate when control measures are needed. One or more of the following triggers will be used:

   (i) The water temperatures in the area; and
   (ii) The air temperatures in the area; and
   (iii) Salinity in the area; and
   (iv) Harvesting techniques in the area; and
   (v) Other factors which affect risk which can be used as a basis for reducing risk.

(b) Implementation of one or more of the following control measures to reduce the risk of *Vibrio vulnificus* illness:

   (i) Labeling oysters, "For shucking by a certified dealer", when the Average Monthly Maximum Water Temperature exceeds 75°F.

   (ii) Subjecting all oysters intended for the raw, half-shell market to Authority approved post harvest processing when the Average Monthly Maximum Water Temperature exceeds 75°F.

   (iii) Labeling oysters, "For shucking by a certified dealer", during the months of April through November, inclusive.

   (iv) Subjecting oysters intended for the raw, half-shell market to Authority approved post harvest processing during the months of April through November, inclusive.

   (v) Reducing time of exposure to temperature prior to delivery to the initial certified dealer based on modeling or sampling, as determined by the Authority in consultation with FDA. For the purpose of time to temperature control, time begins once the first shellstock harvested is no longer submerged. When this control measure is selected, State *Vv plans will include controls when water temperature promotes Vv levels and risk of
illness increases. The controls will minimize risk to less than three (3) illnesses per 100,000 servings when water temperature exceeds 80°F. Authority approved Best Management Practices (BMPs) will be applied to minimize V. v growth to the extent possible when water temperature exceeds 70°F but is less than 80°F. BMPs will ensure that when the water temperature exceeds 70°F but is less than 75°F risk is minimized to less than 1.75 illnesses per 100,000 servings and when water temperatures exceed 75°F but are less than 80°F the risk will not exceed 2.5 illnesses per 100,000 servings. These risks per serving will be determined using the FDA developed Vibrio vulnificus calculator.

(vi) The Authority may implement other comparable alternative controls that will reduce the risk per serving when water temperatures exceed 70°F.

(2) Control Plan Evaluation

(a) In consultation with FDA the Authority will evaluate the implementation and effectiveness of their Control Plan.
   (i) Changes in the annual number of Vibrio vulnificus cases associated with the State’s growing waters.
   (ii) Environmental changes which could affect total Vibrio vulnificus in shellfish pre and post harvest.
   (iii) Industry compliance with existing controls.

(b) The Control Plan shall be modified when the evaluation shows the Plan is ineffective, or when new information or more effective technology is available as determined by the Authority.

E. Contingency Plan

(1) The Contingency Plan shall include a detailed plan outlining the regulatory steps that will be implemented should the number of illnesses reach the threshold established for development and implementation of a Vv Control Plan.

(2) Contingency Plan Evaluation

In consultation with FDA the Authority will evaluate the adequacy of their Contingency Plan.

Guidance Documents, Chapter IV. Naturally Occurring Pathogens

.01 Vibrio Risk Management for Oysters

Background

Current information concerning Vibrio vulnificus, which is responsible for several shellfish associated illnesses and deaths each year can be found in Watkins and McCarthy (1994).
A small number of shellfish-borne illnesses have also been associated with bacteria of the genus Vibrio (Bonner, 1983; Blake et al., 1979; Morris, 1985; Joseph et al., 1982; Roderick, 1982). The Vibrios are free-living aquatic microorganisms, generally inhabiting marine and estuarine waters (Joseph et al., 1982; Spira, 1984; Colwell 1984; Bachman, 1983). Among the marine Vibrios classified as pathogenic are strains of non-O1 Vibrio cholerae, V. parahaemolyticus, and V. vulnificus (Bachman, 1983; Desmarchelier, 1984; Blake, 1980). All three species have been recovered from coastal waters in the United States and other parts of the world (Joseph, 1982; Colwell, 1984; Blake, 1980; DePaola, 1981; Madden, 1982; Davey, 1982; Oliver, 1982; Tamplin, 1982; NIH, 1984). These and other Vibrios have been detected in some environmental samples recovered from areas free of overt sewage contamination and coliform (Bonner, 1983; Joseph, 1982; Spira, 1984).

In general, shellfish-borne vibrio infections have tended to occur in coastal areas in the summer and fall when the water was warmer and vibrio counts were higher (Bonner, 1983; Morris, 1985; Joseph, 1982). V. parahaemolyticus and non-O1 V. cholerae are commonly reported as causing diarrhea illness associated with the consumption of seafood including shellfish (Bonner, 1983; Blake, 1979; Morris, 1985; Joseph, 1982; Baross and Liston, 1970; Morris, 1981). In contrast, V. vulnificus has been related to two distinct syndromes: wound infections, often with tissue necrosis and bacteria, and primary septicemia characterized by fulminant illness in individuals with severe chronic illnesses such as liver disease, hemochromatosis, thalassemia major, alcoholism or malignancy (Bonner et al., 1983; Tacket, 1984). Increasing evidence shows that individuals with such chronic diseases are susceptible to septicemia and death from raw seafood, especially raw oysters (Bonner et al., 1983; Blake, 1979; Morris, 1985; Rodrick, 1982; Bachman, 1983; Blake, 1980; Oliver, 1983; NIH, 1984; Tacket, 1984; Oliver 1982; FDA, 1985). Shellfish-borne vibrio infections can be prevented by cooking seafood thoroughly, keeping them from cross contamination after cooking, and eating them promptly or storing them at hot (60°C or higher) or cold (4°C or lower) temperatures. If oysters and other seafood are to be eaten raw, consumers are probably at lower risk to vibrio infection during months when seawater is cold than when it is warm (Blake, 1983 and 1984).

02 Vibrio vulnificus Management Plan

The voting delegates at the 1999 Annual Meeting in New Orleans created the Vibrio Management Committee (VMC). Subsequently, Vibrio vulnificus and Vibrio parahaemolyticus subcommittees have been charged to develop appropriate illness control measures for these two pathogens. The VMC provides guidance and oversight to the subcommittees. Subcommittee recommendations are reviewed by the VMC before submittal to Task Forces. At the 2001 annual meeting, Task Forces reviewed the VMC's recommendation of reducing the rate of etiologically confirmed shellfish-borne Vibrio vulnificus septicemia with the intention to submit the recommendation to the voting delegates. The goal is to reduce the rate of illness reported in California, Florida, Louisiana and Texas due to the consumption of commercially harvested raw or undercooked oysters by 40 percent, for years 2005 and 2006 (average) and by 60 percent for years 2007 and 2008 (average) from the average illness rate for the years 1995-1999 of 0.306/million. The list of states may be adjusted if after a thorough review, epidemiological and statistical data demonstrates that it would be appropriate. The rate of illness shall be calculated as the number of illnesses adjusted for population. This adjustment will be performed in consultation with statisticians and epidemiologists from California, Florida, Louisiana and Texas and Federal agencies.
reported illnesses in the California, Florida, Louisiana and Texas for the period 1995 to 1999, inclusive, as compiled by the Southeast Regional Office of the U.S. Food and Drug Administration. The data used for measuring goal attainment shall begin with 2002 data. For the purpose of maintaining an accurate count of the number of illnesses report by each state (California, Florida, Louisiana and Texas), the following will apply:

(a) Illness cases counted are those reported by California, Florida, Louisiana and Texas;
(b) Each illness case is recorded under the state that reports it;
(c) Each case is not counted more than once; and
(d) In the event more than one report per case is filed, the case is recorded under the state of diagnosis.

The formula for calculating the rate of illness is as follows:

\[
\text{rate of illness} = \frac{\text{number of cases}}{\text{population}}
\]

The VMC subcommittee members will include, at a minimum, balanced representation from industry and state shellfish control authorities from Vibrio vulnificus Illness Source States—California, Florida, Louisiana and Texas, FDA, NOAA, EPA, CDC, state epidemiologists; as well as industry and shellfish control representatives from other regions. Vibrio vulnificus Illness Source States are those states reporting two (2) or more etiologically confirmed shellfish-borne Vibrio vulnificus illnesses since 1995 traced to the consumption of commercially harvested raw or undercooked oysters that originated from the waters of that state. Etiologically confirmed means those cases in which laboratory evidence of a specific agent is obtained and specified criteria are met.

Recognizing the increasing importance and roles for the Committee, leadership will be expanded and structured in a similar manner as stated in the ISSC By-Laws for Task Forces (reference: ISSC By-Law, Article 1 Task Forces). The VMC Chair shall alternately be selected from a state shellfish control authority and from industry. The Board Chairman, with approval of the Board, shall appoint a VMC Chair and Vice-Chair. If the VMC Chair represents a state shellfish control authority, the Vice-Chair shall be an industry representative. At the end of the VMC Chair’s term of office, the Vice-Chair will become Chairman and a new Vice-Chair will be appointed who represents the same segment of the Conference as the outgoing VMC Chair. A VMC Chair and Vice-Chair should be appointed before October 1, 2001 in order to be consistent with plans for annual VMC meetings and with the effective date of Vibrio vulnificus Risk Management Plans. Likewise, the term of office shall be for (2) years.

The VMC will meet at least annually to develop and approve annual VMC work plans for Vibrio vulnificus illness reduction and review progress. A series of work plans, each covering a one-year period shall be adopted. The first work plan and progress review period will cover a seventeen month period from August 1, 2001 to December 31, 2003 followed subsequently by annual work plans. Work plans will include goals, tasks, performance measures and assessment methods to track and achieve progress towards the illness reduction goals. The work plans will be developed by the VMC and approved by the VMC membership. The chair of the VMC will deliver a written annual progress report, including a summary of the previous year’s progress made in the education program, to the ISSC March executive board meeting. The report shall be made available to the general membership. The annual work plan structure, outlined
below, provides adaptive management and assures consistent progress towards the illness reduction goals. If annual assessment of progress towards achieving the illness reduction goals show inadequate progress the VMC shall incorporate actions into current and subsequent work plans to assure success in achieving those goals. In addition, if annual review shows inadequate progress the VMC will develop issues for deliberation at the 2005 biennial meeting to consider actions such as:

- increased educational efforts,
- limited harvest restriction,
- reduction in time from harvest to refrigeration,
- phased-in post-harvest treatment requirements, or
- other equivalent controls.

Work plans developed by the VMC shall include the following elements and shall define the administrative procedures and resources necessary for accomplishment (i.e. establishment and maintenance):

(a) An ISSC Consumer Education Program targeted toward individuals who consume raw oysters and whose health condition(s) increase their risk for *Vibrio vulnificus* infection. The Education Program's objectives will be 1) to increase the target audience's awareness that eating raw, untreated oysters can be life threatening to them, and; 2) to change the at-risk group's oyster-eating behavior, i.e., to reduce or stop eating raw, untreated oysters. The ISSC Vibrio Management Committee and the *Vibrio vulnificus* Education Subcommittee will evaluate Year 2001 survey results and compare them with the Year 2003 or 2004 survey results to determine the effectiveness in meeting the two objectives of the *Vv* education effort: (1) Show 40% increase in awareness of risk from *Vv*; and (2) Show 15% increase in at-risk consumers no longer eating raw oysters while minimizing impacts to non-at-risk consumer raw oyster consumption.

(i) The Consumer Education Program will focus educational efforts in California, Florida, Louisiana and Texas. The Education Program will make educational materials available to additional states upon request.

(ii) Educational approaches will emphasize partnerships with health and advocacy organizations, and include dissemination of printed materials, posting materials on the Internet, broadcast of television spots, press releases, and other measures deemed effective such as the USDA Physician Notification Program.

(iii) Survey assessments at the state level shall be used as a means of assessing the baseline knowledge and effectiveness of educational interventions.

(b) Administration of a survey to determine the current *Vibrio vulnificus* disease reporting and education in each state.

(c) Creation of a working group to work cooperatively with local, state, and federal agencies and programs to assist in the collection of environmental and epidemiological data to further expand on the current information available. A coordinator may be utilized to facilitate the activities of this working group to develop standardized collection of environmental and epidemiological
information from harvest to consumer.

(d) The Voting Delegates at the 2007 Biennial Meeting in Albuquerque, New Mexico approved appointment of a committee that will consist of three (3) epidemiologists and advisors as appropriate. The Committee will use this form to screen cases for the purposes of determining if a case is attributable to a single-source state as well as whether the case is includable in the Vv Illness Reduction Goals. In addition, to ensure uniformity, the form shall be used for screening 2007-2008 cases and that cases from the baseline will be screened using the same form.

Criteria FOR INCLUDING Vv CASES IN ILLNESS REDUCTION CALCULATIONS and determining source states

1. Each case that is considered must be reported on a Center for Disease Control and Prevention Cholera and Other Vibrio Illness Surveillance Report (COVIS) Form CDC 52.79-

2. Each case must also be listed be on the FDA database (NSSP Guide for the Control of Molluscan Shellfish Guidance Documents Chapter IV.02).

3. The ISSC committee to review reported Vv illnesses to determine the appropriateness of inclusion into the database used for illness reduction calculations must have access to the COVIS form for each case (patient names and other necessary information appropriately redacted). The ISSC addendum form is also provided, where available. This access to the COVIS form is critical for adequate interpretation of the data collected during the state epidemiological investigation.

4. The ISSC Vv Illness Review Committee will complete the following criteria table for each case. These tables serve as documentation.

5. For cases to be included in illness reduction calculations, the following criteria must be met:
   - Item 1-4 and 5a must be answered yes.
   - Should the COVIS form include information that suggests other exposures that may be responsible for the Vv illness further investigation may occur. Consultation with State Shellfish Control Authorities and Epidemiologist from the state is encouraged to determine which exposure should be recorded as the cause of illness. Should oyster consumption not be determined to be the cause of illness the case will not be counted. Should there be disagreements with the inclusion of a case; the disagreeing party may request a review. The request must include a rationale for the review and should be addressed to the Executive Board Chairman.
   - If 5b is no, other exposures should be considered. If no other exposures exist, the case will not be counted.
   - Should the only exposure be consumption of cooked oysters or unknown 5b will be checked yes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vibrio vulnificus Criteria Table</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Case Identifier / Number __________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criteria Status Determination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criteria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Etiologically Confirmed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Septicemia Illness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Reporting State (CA, FL, LA, TX)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Commercial Harvest from US Production

5. Exposures
   a. Onset Consistent with Consumption of Oysters
   b. Raw or undercooked oysters

6. Traceback Information
   a. Were shipping tags available or was other traceback information reported
   b. State of harvest and harvest area(s)
   c. Harvest date(s)

7. Case Determination
   a. Is case included in Vv illness reduction Calculations
   b. Is case attributed to a single source state

Instructions for completing Criteria Table:

- Check YES if Criterion is confirmed from the COVIS form or addendum.
- Check NO if Criterion is not confirmed from the COVIS form or addendum.
- Check UNKNOWN if Criterion is not clear or absent from the COVIS form or addendum.
- No Criterion can have more than one check entered.
- Each Criterion must have one check entered (YES, NO, or UNKNOWN).

These criteria tables will be used to review reported Vv illnesses to determine the appropriateness of inclusion into the database used for illness reduction calculations and will also be used for identifying other source states.

(e) Industry-implemented post-harvest controls to reduce *Vibrio vulnificus* levels in oyster shellstock which may include: time-temperature, post-harvest treatment (i.e. hydrostatic pressure, cool pasteurization, IQF, and irradiation--pending approval), rapid chilling and other emerging technologies.

(f) Pursuit of ISSC options such as industry education and communication; FDA label incentives; PHT specific growing area classifications; targeted time/temperature assessment by FDA during annual shellfish program evaluations; assistance, as necessary, for the further study and possible implementation of dockside icing to investigate its effects on shelf life and variations in the effectiveness of the method as a result of seasonal and regional differences and incentives to add refrigeration capacity to harvest vessels. The goal will be to provide incentives necessary to post-harvest treat 25 percent of all oysters intended for the raw, half-shell market during the months of May through September harvested from a Source State by the end of the third year (December 31, 2004). The assessment will include the capacity of all operational plants and the capacity of plants under construction. Should the 25 percent goal not be accomplished, the VMC will investigate and report their findings as to why the goal was not reached.

(g) Development by the VMC of a list of issues relating to public health, various technologies including Post-harvest treatments; marketability; shelf-life and similar matters that lend themselves to investigation. The VMC will work with FDA, NOAA, CDC, EPA, the shellfish industry and other entities as appropriate to obtain or facilitate the investigation of the issues listed and take the results into account as it develops plans or recommended Issues for the ISSC.

(h) Provision for VMC compilation and review of the data on rates of illness, which will be made available to the ISSC at the ISSC Biennial meeting following the year in which the data was gathered. In the event that the data is not available at the time of the meeting, the VMC shall meet and review the
data when it becomes available and issue a compilation report, which will be made available to the entire ISSC membership. In the event there is no Biennial meeting scheduled for a certain year, the VMC shall meet and review the data when it becomes available and issue a compilation report which will be made available to the entire membership.

(i) Provision for a VMC evaluation of the effectiveness of reduction efforts, which will be conducted at the end of the fifth year (December 31, 2006). The evaluation will determine whether the 40 percent, 5-year goal to reduce the rate of illness or education/consumer intervention or post harvest controls performance measures set forth in prior work plans have been achieved. Should the VMC evaluation indicate the 40 percent, 5-year goal has not been accomplished, the committee will identify additional harvest controls in the 2007–2008 work plan to assure achievement of the 60 percent reduction in the rate of illness goal by the close of the seventh year. In addition, the VMC will evaluate the requirements in Section 04.C, with the possibility of changing the controls to achieve remaining illness reduction goals.

(j) Should a disagreement arise between FDA and the Authority on the equivalency of a control as described in .04(C), the V.v. Subcommittee will be requested to provide guidance.

(k) In 2006 the Executive Board directed the elimination of the Vv & Vp subcommittees. The VMC assumed all responsibilities of the subcommittees as outlined in the Vibrio vulnificus Management Guidance Document. Representation on the VMC Committee will be consistent with all guidance (VMC and Vv subcommittee) outlined in the Vibrio vulnificus Management Guidance Document.

(l) Shellstock Harvested in Source States Harvesters must include on the tag of all product harvested for restricted use the statement “for shucking by a certified dealer” and/or “For PHP Only.” Harvesting controls must be provided by the Authority to ensure that restricted use shellstock is not diverted to retail or food service. Dealers must establish a restricted use shellstock Critical Limit as part of their HACCP Plan for receiving. A shipping Critical Control Point must include a restricted use shellstock disposition step. Restricted use shellstock is not intended for retail or food service.

Should a disagreement arise between FDA and the Authority on the equivalency of a control as described in .04(C), the V.v. Subcommittee will be requested to provide guidance.

In 2006 the Executive Board directed the elimination of the Vv & Vp subcommittees. The VMC assumed all responsibilities of the subcommittees as outlined in the Vibrio vulnificus Management Guidance Document. Representation on the VMC Committee will be consistent with all guidance (VMC and Vv subcommittee) outlined in the Vibrio vulnificus Management Guidance Document.

.013 Vibrio parahaemolyticus Control Plan
.024 Post Harvest Processing Validation Verification Interim Guidance for Vibrio vulnificus and Vibrio parahaemolyticus
.035 Guidance for Demonstrating the Effectiveness of Time to Temperature Reduction Criteria for Vibrio vulnificus and Vibrio parahaemolyticus
## Public Health Significance:

The level of $Vv$ in oysters at the time of harvest can cause illness in immunocompromised individuals with increased susceptibility. This risk ranges from approximately .06 to 3.33 illnesses per 100,000 servings depending upon water temperature. The controls presently required by State *Vibrio vulnificus* Control Plans, if properly implemented, can reduce growth and reduce *Vibrio vulnificus* levels after harvest.

Changes will provide additional options for managing the risks associated with $Vv$. These options will not require Post Harvest Processing (PHP) controls which are presently not economically feasible. The RTI Economic Study suggested that it would take 2 to 3 years to implement PHP and, even with that time for implementation, would create a significant economic burden.

### References:

1. VMC Committee Reports (Al Rainosek's updated illness rate Calculations);
2. RTI International Report Project Number 0211460.008
3. "Analysis of How Post-harvest processing Technologies for Controlling *Vibrio vulnificus* Can Be Implemented"; Dr. Steve Otwell, Laura Garrido, Victor Garrido and Dr. Charlie Sims report "Sensory Assessment Study for Post-Harvest Processed (PHP) Oysters"

### Cost Information:

(if available)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposal for Consideration at the Interstate Shellfish Sanitation Conference 2011 Biennial Meeting</th>
<th>Growing Area Harvesting/Handling/Distribution Administrative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Name of Submitter:** *Vibrio* Management Committee  
**Affiliation:** Interstate Shellfish Sanitation Conference (ISSC)  
**Address:** 209-2 Dawson Road Columbia, SC 29223-1740  
**Phone:** 803-788-7559  
**Fax:** 803-788-7576  
**Email:** issc@issc.org

**Proposal Subject:** Transportation and Critical Control Points  
**Specific NSSP Guide Reference:**  
- Section II Model Ordinance, Chapter IX. Transportation  
- Section II Model Ordinance, Chapter XI. Shucking and Packing  
- Section II Model Ordinance, Chapter XII. Repacking of Shucked Shellfish  
- Section II Model Ordinance, Chapter XIII. Shellstock Shipping  
- Section II Model Ordinance, Chapter XIV. Reshipping

**Key Words:** *Vibrio vulnificus* Risk Management

**Text of Proposal/Requested Action:** *Recommended Changes to Chapter IX. Transportation Requirements for the Harvester/Dealer.*

01 Trucks or Other Vehicles Used to Transport Shellstock to the Original Dealer.

A. The harvester, or dealer who transports shellstock from the harvester to the original dealer, shall assure that all trucks used to transport shellstock are properly constructed, operated, and maintained to prevent contamination, deterioration, and decomposition.

B. Storage bins on trucks or other vehicles used in the transport of shellstock for direct marketing shall be:
   1. Kept clean with potable water or water from an approved area or conditionally approved area in the open status; and
   2. Provided with effective drainage.

C. Shellstock shall be transported in adequately refrigerated trucks *or iced* when the shellstock have been previously refrigerated or when ambient air temperature and time of travel are such that unacceptable bacterial growth or deterioration may occur.

D. Prechilling trucks or other vehicles shall be required when ambient air temperatures are such that unacceptable bacterial growth or deterioration may occur.

E. When mechanical refrigeration units are used, the units shall be:
   1. Equipped with automatic controls; and
   2. [Maintained at an ambient air temperature in the storage area at temperatures of 45° Fahrenheit (7.2° Centigrade) or less](#) in the storage area.

F. Any ice used to cool shellstock during transport shall meet the requirements of...
Chapter XI.02A(4)(2).
G. Cats, dogs, and other animals shall not be allowed in any part of the truck or
other vehicle where shellstock is stored.

.02 Receiving Shellfish

A. The dealer shall reject or discard any shellfish shipments which:
   (1) Do not originate from a licensed harvester or dealer; and/or
   (2) Are unwholesome, inadequately protected, or whose source cannot be
       identified.
B. Transportation agents or common carriers used by a dealer are not required to
   be certified.
C. The dealer shall:
   (1) Inspect incoming shellfish shipments to assure that the shipments are
       received under the conditions required in this Chapter;
   (2) Place shellstock under temperature control within one (1) hours after
       receipt from the harvester, or when the dealer is also the harvester,
       when shellstock reaches the dealer's facility;
   (3) Ensure that shellstock are not permitted to remain without ice,
       mechanical refrigeration, or other approved means of lowering the
       internal body temperature of the shellstock to, or maintaining it at, 50°
       Fahrenheit (10° Centigrade) or less for more than one (1) hours at
       points of transfer such as loading docks;
   (4) Ensure that shucked shellfish and in-shell product are not permitted to
       remain without ice, mechanical refrigeration, or other approved means
       of maintaining shellfish temperature at 45° Fahrenheit (7.2°
       Centigrade) or less; and
   (5) Ensure that frozen shellfish remain frozen.
D. For the purpose of this section, temperature control is defined as the
   management of the environmental temperature of the shellstock by means of
   ice, mechanical refrigeration or other means approved by the Authority.

.05 Shipping Times.

A. Shipping Time is No More Than Four Hours.
   (1) When the shipping time is four hours or less, the dealer shall ship all
       shellfish:
       (a) Well iced; or
       (b) Using other acceptable means of refrigeration.
   (2) When mechanical refrigeration units are used, the units shall be
       equipped with automatic controls and shall be capable of
       maintaining the ambient air in the storage area at temperatures of
       45° Fahrenheit (7.2° Centigrade) or less in the storage area.
   (3) The dealer shall not be required to provide thermal recorders during
       shipment.
   (4) Lack of ice or other acceptable types of refrigeration shall be
       considered an unsatisfactory shipping condition.
B. Shipping Time is Greater Than Four Hours.
   (1) When the shipping time is greater than four hours, the dealer shall ship
       all shellfish in:
       (a) Mechanically refrigerated conveyances which are equipped with
           automatic controls and capable of maintaining the ambient air in
the storage area at temperatures of 45° Fahrenheit (7.2° Centigrade) or less in the storage area; or
(b) Containers with an internal ambient air temperature maintained at or below temperatures of 45° Fahrenheit (7.2° Centigrade) or less.

(2) Unless the dealer has an approved HACCP plan with an alternate means of monitoring time-temperature, the initial dealer shall assure that a suitable time-temperature recording device accompanies each shipment of shellfish.

(3) The initial dealer shall note the date and time on the temperature-indicating device, if appropriate.

(4) Each receiving dealer shall write the date and time on the temperature-indicating device, if appropriate, when the shipment is received and the doors of the conveyance or the containers are opened.

(5) The final receiving dealer shall keep the time-temperature recording chart or other record of time and temperature in his files and shall make it available to the Authority upon request.

(6) An inoperative temperature-indicating device shall be considered as no recording device.

Recommended Changes to Chapters XI. Shucking and Packing

Requirements for Dealers.

.01 Critical Control Points.

A. Receiving Critical Control Point - Critical Limits. The dealer shall shuck and pack only:

(1) Shellstock obtained from a licensed harvester who has:
   (a) Harvested the shellstock from an Approved or Conditionally Approved area in the open status as indicated by the tag; and [C]
   (b) Identified the shellstock with a tag on each container or transaction record on each bulk shipment; or [C]

(2) Shellstock obtained from a dealer other than the original harvester who has:
   (a) Shipped the shellstock adequately iced; or in a conveyance at or below 45°F (7.2°C) ambient air temperature; under 50°F (10°C) internal temperature or less; or in a conveyance capable of lowering the temperature of the shellstock and will maintain it at 50°F (10°C) or less; [C]; and
   (b) Identified the shellstock with a tag on each container or transaction record with each bulk shipment. [C]

(3) In-shell product obtained from a dealer who has:
   (a) Shipped the in-shell product adequately iced; or in a conveyance at or below 45°F (7.2°C) ambient air temperature; or 45°F (7.2°C) internal temperature or less; and [C]
   (b) Identified the in-shell product with a tag on each container [C]

B. Shellstock Storage Critical Control Point - Critical Limits. The dealer shall ensure that:

(1) If wet storage in artificial bodies of water is practiced, water quality meets the requirements outlined in Chapter X.08; and [C]
(2) Once placed under temperature control and until sale to the processor
or final consumer, shellstock shall be;
(a) Iced; or [C]
(b) Placed and stored in a storage area or conveyance maintained at 45°F (7.2°C) or less; and [C]
(c) Not permitted to remain without ice, mechanical refrigeration or other approved methods of refrigeration, as required in §B (1) or §B (2) for more than 2 hours at points of transfer such as loading docks. [C]

C. In-shell Product Storage Critical Control Point - Critical Limits. The dealer shall ensure that in-shell product shall be:
(1) Iced; or [C]
(2) Placed and stored in a storage area or conveyance maintained at 45°F (7.2°C) or less. [C]

D. Processing Critical Control Point - Critical Limits. The dealer shall ensure that:
(1) For shellstock which has not been refrigerated prior to shucking, shucked meats are chilled to an internal temperature of 45°F (7.2°C) or less within three hours of shucking. [C]
(2) For shellstock refrigerated prior to shucking, shucked meats are chilled to an internal temperature of 45°F (7.2°C) or less within four hours of removal from refrigeration. [C]
(3) If heat shock is used, once heat shocked shellstock is shucked, the shucked shellfish meats shall be cooled to 45°F (7.2°C) or less within two hours after the heat shock process. [C]
(4) When heat shock shellstock are cooled and held under refrigeration for later shucking, the heat shocked shellstock shall be cooled to an internal temperature of 45°F (7.2°C) within two hours from time of heat shock. [C]
(5) For in-shell product the internal temperature of meats does not exceed 45°F (7.2°C) for more than 2 hours during processing. [C]

E. Shucked Meat Storage Critical Control Point - Critical Limit. The dealer shall store shucked and packed shellfish in covered containers at an ambient temperature of 45°F (7.2°C) or less or covered with ice. [C]

F. Shellstock Shipping Critical Control Point.
(1) The dealer shall ensure that Shellstock that is received bearing a restricted use tag shall only be shipped to a certified dealer and shall include specific language detailing the intended use of the shellstock.

Recommended Changes to Chapter XII. Repacking of Shucked Shellfish

.01 Critical Control Points.

A. Receiving Critical Control Point - Critical Limits. The dealer shall repack only shellfish which:
(1) Originated from a dealer who has:
   (a) Shipped the shellfish iced, or in a conveyance at or below 45°F (7.2°C) ambient air temperature; [C] and
   (b) Identified the shellfish with a label as outlined in Chapter X.06. [C]

B. Processing Critical Control Point - Critical Limits. The dealer shall ensure that repacked shucked shellfish do not exceed an internal temperature of 45°F
(7.2°C) for more than 2 hours. [C]

C. Shucked Meat Storage Critical Control Point - Critical Limit. The dealer shall store repacked shellfish in covered containers at an ambient temperature of 45°F (7.2°C) or less or covered in ice. [C]

D. Shellstock Shipping Critical Control Point Shellstock that is received bearing a restricted use tag shall only be shipped to a certified dealer and shall include specific language detailing the intended use of the shellstock.

Recommended Changes to Chapter XIII. Shellstock Shipping

.01 Critical Control Points.

A. Receiving Critical Control Point - Critical Limits. The dealer shall ship or repack only:

(1) Shellstock obtained from a licensed harvester who has:
   (a) Harvested the shellstock from an Approved or Conditionally Approved area in the open status as identified by the tag; and [C]
   (b) Identified the shellstock with a tag on each container or transaction record on each bulk shipment; or [C]

(2) Shellstock obtained from a dealer other than the original harvester who has:
   (a) Shipped the shellstock adequately iced, or in a conveyance at or below 45°F (7.2°C) ambient air temperature and or 50°F (10°C) internal temperature or less; or in a conveyance capable of lowering the temperature of the shellstock and will maintain it at 50°F (10°C) or less [C]; and
   (b) Identified the shellstock with a tag on each container. [C]

(3) In-shell product obtained from a dealer who has;
   (a) Shipped the in-shell product adequately iced; or in a conveyance or at or below 45°F (7.2°C) ambient air temperature; or 45°F (7.2°C) internal temperature or less; and [C]
   (b) Identified the in-shell product with a tag on each container. [C]

B. Receiving Critical Control Point - Critical Limits. The dealer shall ship or repack only:

(1) Shellstock obtained from a licensed harvester who has:
   (a) Harvested the shellstock from an Approved or Conditionally Approved area in the open status as identified by the tag; and [C]
   (b) Identified the shellstock with a tag on each container or transaction record on each bulk shipment; or [C]

   (2) Shellstock obtained from a dealer other than the original harvester who has:
   (a) Shipped the shellstock adequately iced, or in a conveyance at or below 45°F (7.2°C) ambient air temperature or 50°F (10°C) internal temperature or less; or in a conveyance capable of lowering the temperature of the shellstock and will maintain it at 50°F (10°C) or less [C]; and
   (b) Identified the shellstock with a tag on each container. [C]

(3) In-shell product obtained from a dealer who has;
   (a) Shipped the in-shell product adequately iced; or in a conveyance or at or below 45°F (7.2°C) ambient air temperature; or 45°F (7.2°C) internal temperature or less; and [C]
   (b) Identified the in-shell product with a tag on each container. [C]
C. Shellstock Storage Critical Control Point - Critical Limits. The dealer shall ensure that:
   (1) If wet storage in artificial bodies of water is practiced, water quality meets the requirements outlined in Chapter X.08; and [C]
   (2) Once placed under temperature control and until sale to the processor or final consumer, shellstock shall be:
      (a) Iced; or [C]
      (b) Placed in a storage area or conveyance maintained at 45°F (7.2°C) or less; and [C]
      (c) Not permitted to remain without ice, mechanical refrigeration or other approved methods of refrigeration, as required in §B(B)(1) or §B(2) for more than 2 hours at points of transfer such as loading docks. [C]

D. In-shell Product Storage Critical Control Point - Critical Limits. The dealer shall ensure that in-shell product shall be:
   (1) Iced; or [C]
   (2) Placed and stored in a storage area or conveyance maintained at 45°F (7.2°C) or less. [C]

E. Shellstock Shipping Critical Control Point
   (1) Shellstock that is received bearing a restricted use tag shall only be shipped to a certified dealer and shall include specific language detailing the intended use of the shellstock.
   (2) Should a State be implementing a Vibrio parahaemolyticus or Vibrio vulnificus Control Plan the dealer shall only ship shellstock that has been cooled to the temperature outlined in the State Plan.

Recommended Changes to Chapter XIV. Reshipping

.01 Critical Control Points.

A. Receiving Critical Control Point - Critical Limits. The dealer shall reship only shellfish which:
   (1) Originated from a dealer other than the original harvester who has:
      (a) Shipped the shellstock adequately iced; or in a conveyance at or below 45°F (7.2°C) ambient air temperature; and/or 50°F (10°C) internal temperature or less; or in a conveyance capable of lowering the temperature of the shellstock and will maintain it at 50°F (10°C) or less; [C]; and/or
      (b) Shipped the shucked shellfish and/or in-shell product iced or in a conveyance at or below 45°F (7.2°C) ambient air temperature; [C] and
      (e) Identified the shellstock with a tag as outlined in Chapter X.05, identified the in-shell product with a tag as outlined in Chapter X.07, and/or identified the shucked shellfish with a label as outlined in Chapter X.06. [C]

B. Shellstock Shipping Critical Control Point Shellstock that is received bearing a restricted use tag shall only be shipped to a certified dealer and shall include specific language detailing the intended use of the shellstock.

Public Health Significance: The present Vv and Vp Control Plans of the Model Ordinance include time to temperature controls which require that shellstock be cooled and maintained at specific temperatures to limit post harvest growth of Vv and Vp. For these controls to be effective it is imperative that the shellstock be maintained at the temperatures outlined
in the Control Plans. The proposed changes to Chapter IX., XI., XIII., and XIV. are intended to modify present requirements to ensure that these temperatures are maintained. Recent FDA audits of $V_v$ and $V_p$ Control Plan compliance and reports from States and the industry suggest that these modifications are necessary.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cost Information: (if available)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>